If and Whether in Indirect Speech

Kenji Sonoda

Abstract

When if or whether follows a transitive or an adjective and precedes a noun clause, these subordinators are interchangeably used except in some cases. Of if and whether, which is more preferably used in current American English and British English? How did the people's preference for these conjunctions change in about a hundred years 1900-1994? In order to clarify these, 24 weeklies or monthlies were made use of here.

To be very brief, in American English in 1994, if is more preferably used than whether, while around 1900 in American English, if was used almost as frequently as whether. In British English in 1994, whether is more frequently used than if, and the situation was much the same around 1900.

Key Words: If, Whether, American English, British English.

1. Introduction

It is the objective of this paper to examine the frequency in current American English (AmE) and British English (BrE) of if and whether that follow transitives or adjectives and precede noun clauses, and to see at the same time what kind of change about a hundred years 1900-1994 brought to the frequency of these subordinators. In order to see the change minutely, the period 1900-1994 was divided into four: 1900, 1930, 1960 and 1994, and three weeklies or monthlies published in the United States and Britain in each of these years were selected. These magazines may not be the most representative ones in the United States or Britain, yet they will be of some use in grasping the general trend.

The materials made use of here are as follows:

AmE:


BrE:


2. The interchangeability of if and whether

Partridge (1973:149) says that when if or whether follows a transitive or an adjective and they precede a noun clause, these conjunctions are not interchangeable. If for whether is always wrong and often ambiguous, but the mixture of the two is wrong, ambiguous — and amusing. "She was wondering if Rupert [her husband] would like an heir, and whether it was time that they moved from the doll's house in Bourdon Street ...." In that good writer and erudite scholar Sir Maurice Bowra's Sophoclean Tragedy, we notice this lapse: "(Contemporaries) would catch his hints and suggestions, and know if he intended to surprise them with a paradox or to expose some familiar way of thought." (Many American grammarians grant the use of if for whether in informal style if the tag or not is omitted.)

However, almost all the grammarians today agree that if and whether are interchangeable in indirect speech except in some cases in BrE as well as in AmE. In fact, the instances of these two subordinators used in this way are to be seen already in the OE period. The *OED* cites instances of if and whether that date back to the OE period.

---

1 The Department of General Education, the School of Allied Medical Sciences, Nagasaki University.
The instance of *if* can also be seen in Shakespeare:

How shall know if I do choose the right? — *The Merchant of Venice* (1597)\(^{11}\)

In addition, there is a famous instance of *if* from the King James Bible of 1611.

Also he sent forth a dove from him, to see if the waters were abated from off the face of the ground. — Genesis 8:8

This is the only instance of *if* that is used in indirect speech in Genesis. However, *whether* is used more frequently in Genesis: there are as many as six instances of *whether* in this use in Genesis in the King James Bible (18:21, 24:21, 37:14, 37:32, 42:16, 43:6), although nobody seems to have pointed it out. This might roughly show that *whether* was a more general form of expression than *if* in indirect speech in those days. Be that as it may, the following are two of those instances of *whether* from Genesis:

a. I will go down now, and see whether they have done altogether according to the cry of it .... — 18:21
b. And the man wondering at her held his peace, to wit whether the Lord had made his journey prosperous or not. — 24:21

In this way, *if* and *whether* are generally interchangeable when they follow transitives or adjectives, yet there are some cases where *if* and *whether* are not interchangeable. Such instances need to be excluded here in comparing the frequency of the two subordinators. The instances in the following (A)(B)(C)(D) include cases where *if* and *whether* are not interchangeable. The fact that in a large number of instances where *whether* is possible, *if* cannot take the place of *whether* may show that originally *whether*, and not *if*, led a leading role in this use.

(A) Syntactically, in the following (1)(2), *whether* cannot be replaced by *if*:

(1) a. I don't know whether to laugh or cry. (*SP* 1994)
   b. *I don't know if to laugh or cry.
(2) a. Whether the leopard was still sitting over his supper I do not know. (*BL* 1930)
   b. *If the leopard was still sitting over his

(B) Also syntactically, in the following (1)(2), *whether* is preferred to *if*, and they are not interchangeable, although *if* is also possible in these cases (*cf. Swan 1995:620):

(1) a. We'll be told tomorrow whether we are needed or not. (*OALDS*)
   b. We'll be told tomorrow if we are needed or not.
(2) a. How can he tell whether a new book may or may not be useful to him? (*AM* 1930)
   b. How can he tell if a new book may or may not be useful to him?

(C) Semantically, there are sometimes cases like the following (1ab) in which an *if*-clause denotes desire or expectation on the part of the speaker. A *whether*-clause can also show such desire or expectation on the part of the speaker like the following (2), yet compared with the instances of *if*, those of *whether* seem to be highly limited\(^{11}\). In my materials, there are 12 instances of *if* and one instance of *whether* in this use in AmE and BrE. Thus, this use is highly lopsided in favor of *if*, which makes it necessary to eliminate those instances altogether:

(1) a. Swiss Red Cross asked him if he would serve for six months in the Cambodian capital. (*RE* 1994)
   b. I asked John D. Whittier and asked him if he would address such an audience as ours. (*AT* 1930)
   c. Peter asked if he could get himself a fresh drink of water. (*AT* 1930)
(2) I asked whether we could play mixed doubles. (*TA* 1994)

(D) Alexander (1988:346) says that either *if* or *whether* is used with certain verbs and adjectives. In these cases *if* and *whether* follow these verbs and adjectives are interchangeable. He also says that certain verbs are used with *whether* and not with *if*. In these cases *whether* and *if* are not interchangeable. Verbs and adjectives that can be used with either *if* or *whether* are agree, ask, care, (not) certain, check, decide, doubt, find out, forget, gather, guess, inquire, know, learn, matter, mind, notice, record, say, see, show, (not) sure, understand, want to know, wonder. Verbs that are used with *whether* are choose, confess, confirm, discuss, explain, prove, teach, think. The instances that have these verbs must be excluded here. However, of these verbs, *discuss, care, and matter* need some elucidation.

Alexander (1988:294, 346) says that *discuss can
If and Whether in Indirect Speech

be used only with whether, and not with if. However, Swan (1995:620) says that discuss can be used with if, but that whether is more normal:

After some verbs, whether is preferred to if.

We discussed whether we should close the shop.

(More normal than We discussed if....)

Although there is thus a difference in opinion with regard to discuss, it is certain that when discuss is used, whether is preferred. This makes it necessary to exclude the instances where this verb is used, together with other instances where such other verbs as choose, confess, confirm, etc. listed above are used.

What about care? Care is used like the following:

a. Roger and Hammerstein don't care if any of "The Sound of Music" is played on any station. (NE 1960)

b. They do not care whether it is a fact or not. (A 1900)

Care cannot be used transitively; it can be used only intransitively. Therefore, the if- or whether-clause following care is not a noun clause but a concessive adverb clause that is "used to say that something will or will not happen whatever the situation is" (LDOCE3). Hence, care cannot be treated in the same category with other verbs like choose, confess, etc. as Alexander does. The instances of care must be excluded here when it is followed by if or whether. What about matter? Matter is used like the following:

a. In truth, it wouldn't matter if Packer became the next Mother Teresa. (TA 1994)

b. ... it did not really matter if bilgewater did slosh round them occasionally. (BL 1960)

In the instances above, the if-clauses are concessive, and they do not act as object of matter. Here confusion is also seen in Alexander. Hence matter must also be excluded.

3. The frequency of if and whether

Tables 1 and 2 show the actual figures of the occurrences of if and whether in AmE and BrE from 1900 to 1994 that appear in the instances where the two subordinators are interchangeable.

Tables 1 and 2 reveal some facts of interest.

First of all, in AmE, in 1994, when if and whether are interchangeable, if is used more frequently than whether: if is used in little less than 70 percent of the instances, and whether a little more than 30 percent of the instances. The situation is the reverse in BrE: in BrE, in 1994, whether is used more frequently than if. Whether is used in 75 percent of the instances and if in 25 percent of the instances.

In AmE if was used a little more frequently than, or almost as frequently as, whether from around 1900 to around 1960, yet in 1994 if predominates. In BrE generally whether was used more frequently than if during the period 1900-1994, although it seems to have been used almost as frequently as if around 1960.

A hundred years seems to have brought some change to AmE. If rose from 54 percent of 1900 to 67 percent of 1994. It is a 24 percent increase. Whether declined from 46 percent of 1900 to 33 percent of 1994. It is a 28 percent decrease. On the other hand, a hundred years has not brought any change to BrE. In BrE, in 1900 if was used in 23
percent of the instances; in 1994 it is used in 25 percent of the instances. In 1900 whether was used in 77 percent of the instances; in 1994 it is used in 75 percent of the instances. Evidently BrE is more conservative than AmE.

What is the reason for the gradual increase of if, and conversely the gradual decrease of whether in AmE? There may be a number of reasons for it, such as a person’s likes or dislikes, or euphony of a sentence, but I suspect that the informalization of AmE is one of the main reasons, for if is generally considered informal and whether formal.

4. Concluding remarks

When if or whether precedes a noun clause and follow a transitive or an adjective, if is used approximately twice as frequently as whether in AmE in 1994, while in BrE in 1994 if is used almost as frequently as whether. In AmE a hundred years has brought some change to the frequency of if and whether: compared with those in 1900, the instances have increased in AmE in 1994. In BrE a hundred years has brought no significant change to the frequency if and whether: in 1994 if is used almost as frequently as in 1900 in BrE.

Notes

References

Dictionaries
If and Whether in Indirect Speech

間接話法における If と Whether

園 田 健 二

1 長崎大学医療技術短期大学部一般教育等

要 旨 名詞節を導く if と whether が現在の英米語ではどちらが多く使われているかをみ、またその理由を考えてみた。現在での状況をより良く把握するために現在までの100年間におけるこれらの接続詞の英米における使用頻度の変化もみてみた。

長崎大学医療技短大紀 9: 9-13, 1995